# A semidefinite approach to the $K_{i}$-cover problem 

João Gouveia

University of Coimbra

4th of August - SIAM AG 2013
with James Pfeiffer (U.Washington)

## Triangle covers and Triangle-free sets

Given a graph $G=(V, E)$ we have:


## Triangle covers and Triangle-free sets

Given a graph $G=(V, E)$ we have:


A triangle cover is a set of edges including at least one from each triangle

## Triangle covers and Triangle-free sets

Given a graph $G=(V, E)$ we have:


A triangle cover is a set of edges including at least one from each triangle


A triangle-free subgraph is a set of edges not containing any triangle

These sets are complementary to each other.

## Triangle-Cover Problem

Consider $G=(V, E)$ and edge-weights $\omega$.

## Triangle-Cover Problem

Consider $G=(V, E)$ and edge-weights $\omega$.
Min Triangle Cover Problem
Find a triangle cover $T \subseteq E$ for which

$$
\sum_{e \in T} \omega_{e}
$$

is minimum.

## Triangle-Cover Problem

Consider $G=(V, E)$ and edge-weights $\omega$.

Min Triangle Cover Problem
Find a triangle cover $T \subseteq E$ for which

$$
\sum_{e \in T} \omega_{e}
$$

is minimum.

Max Triangle Free Problem
Find a triangle-free set $F \subseteq E$ for which

$$
\sum_{e \in F} \omega_{e}
$$

is maximum.

## Triangle-Cover Problem

Consider $G=(V, E)$ and edge-weights $\omega$.
Min Triangle Cover Problem
Find a triangle cover $T \subseteq E$ for which

$$
\sum_{e \in T} \omega_{e}
$$

is minimum.

Remarks:

- These problems are equivalent.


## Triangle-Cover Problem

Consider $G=(V, E)$ and edge-weights $\omega$.

Min Triangle Cover Problem
Find a triangle cover $T \subseteq E$ for which

$$
\sum_{e \in T} \omega_{e}
$$

is minimum.

Max Triangle Free Problem
Find a triangle-free set $F \subseteq E$ for which

$$
\sum_{e \in F} \omega_{e}
$$

is maximum.

Remarks:

- These problems are equivalent.
- These problems are NP-complete.


## $K_{i}$-Cover Problem

Let $G$ be any graph, and $\mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ its set of cliques of size $i-1$.

## $K_{i}$-Cover Problem

Let $G$ be any graph, and $\mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ its set of cliques of size $i-1$.
Min $K_{i}$-Cover Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-cover $T \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k \in T} \omega_{k}
$$

is minimum.

## $K_{i}$-Cover Problem

Let $G$ be any graph, and $\mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ its set of cliques of size $i-1$.

Min $K_{i}$-Cover Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-cover $T \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k \in T} \omega_{k}
$$

is minimum.

Max Triangle Free Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-free set $F \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which
is maximum.

## $K_{i}$-Cover Problem

Let $G$ be any graph, and $\mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ its set of cliques of size $i-1$.

Min $K_{i}$-Cover Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-cover $T \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k \in T} \omega_{k}
$$

is minimum.
Remarks:

Max Triangle Free Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-free set $F \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k=0}=
$$

is maximum.

## $K_{i}$-Cover Problem

Let $G$ be any graph, and $\mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ its set of cliques of size $i-1$.

Min $K_{i}$-Cover Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-cover $T \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k \in T} \omega_{k}
$$

is minimum.

Max Triangle Free Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-free set $F \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{\text {mak }}
$$

is maximum.

Remarks:

- For $i=3$ is the triangle cover problem.


## $K_{i}$-Cover Problem

Let $G$ be any graph, and $\mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ its set of cliques of size $i-1$.

Min $K_{i}$-Cover Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-cover $T \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k \in T} \omega_{k}
$$

is minimum.

## Max Triangle Free Problem

Find a $K_{i}$-free set $F \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k=1}^{u k}
$$

is maximum.

Remarks:

- For $i=3$ is the triangle cover problem.
- For $i=2$ is the stable set problem.


## $K_{i}$-Cover Problem

Let $G$ be any graph, and $\mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ its set of cliques of size $i-1$.

Min $K_{i}$-Cover Problem
Find a $K_{i}$-cover $T \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k \in T} \omega_{k}
$$

is minimum.

## Max Triangle Free Problem

Find a $K_{i}$-free set $F \subseteq \mathcal{K}_{i-1}$ for which

$$
\sum_{k=1}^{u k}
$$

is maximum.

Remarks:

- For $i=3$ is the triangle cover problem.
- For $i=2$ is the stable set problem.
- All are NP-complete [Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub]


## Triangle-Free Polytope

Given a graph $G=(\{1, \ldots, n\}, E)$ we define $P_{3}(G)$, the triangle-free polytope of $G$, in the following way:

## Triangle-Free Polytope

Given a graph $G=(\{1, \ldots, n\}, E)$ we define $P_{3}(G)$, the triangle-free polytope of $G$, in the following way:

- For every triangle-free set $F \subseteq E$ consider its characteristic vector $\chi_{F} \in\{0,1\}^{E}$;


## Triangle-Free Polytope

Given a graph $G=(\{1, \ldots, n\}, E)$ we define $P_{3}(G)$, the triangle-free polytope of $G$, in the following way:

- For every triangle-free set $F \subseteq E$ consider its characteristic vector $\chi_{F} \in\{0,1\}^{E}$;
- let $S_{3} \subset\{0,1\}^{n}$ be the collection of all those vectors;


## Triangle-Free Polytope

Given a graph $G=(\{1, \ldots, n\}, E)$ we define $P_{3}(G)$, the triangle-free polytope of $G$, in the following way:

- For every triangle-free set $F \subseteq E$ consider its characteristic vector $\chi_{F} \in\{0,1\}^{E}$;
- let $S_{3} \subset\{0,1\}^{n}$ be the collection of all those vectors;
- the polytope $P_{3}(G)$ is then defined as the convex hull of the vectors in $S_{3}$.


## Example



## Example



$$
S_{G}=\{(0,0,0),(1,0,0),(0,1,0),(0,0,1),(1,1,0),(0,1,1),(1,0,1)\}
$$

## Example



$$
S_{G}=\{(0,0,0),(1,0,0),(0,1,0),(0,0,1),(1,1,0),(0,1,1),(1,0,1)\}
$$



## Example



$$
S_{G}=\{(0,0,0),(1,0,0),(0,1,0),(0,0,1),(1,1,0),(0,1,1),(1,0,1)\}
$$



## Reformulation

Triangle-Free Problem Reformulated
Given a graph $G=(V, E)$ and a weight vector $\omega \in \mathbb{R}^{E}$, solve

$$
\mu(G, \omega):=\max _{x \in P_{3}(G)}\langle\omega, x\rangle .
$$

## Reformulation

## Triangle-Free Problem Reformulated

Given a graph $G=(V, E)$ and a weight vector $\omega \in \mathbb{R}^{E}$, solve

$$
\mu(G, \omega):=\max _{x \in P_{3}(G)}\langle\omega, x\rangle .
$$

However finding $P_{3}(G)$ is as hard as solving the original problem.

## Reformulation

## Triangle-Free Problem Reformulated

Given a graph $G=(V, E)$ and a weight vector $\omega \in \mathbb{R}^{E}$, solve

$$
\mu(G, \omega):=\max _{x \in P_{3}(G)}\langle\omega, x\rangle .
$$

However finding $P_{3}(G)$ is as hard as solving the original problem.

We intend to find approximations for it.

## Fractional Triangle-Free Polytope

The simplest relaxation of $P_{3}(G)$ is the fractional triangle free polytope of $G, \operatorname{FRAC}_{\Delta}(G)$, the set defined by the following inequalities.

## Fractional Triangle-Free Polytope

The simplest relaxation of $P_{3}(G)$ is the fractional triangle free polytope of $G, \operatorname{FRAC}_{\Delta}(G)$, the set defined by the following inequalities.

- $1 \geq x_{i} \geq 0$ for $i \in E(0-1$ constrains $)$;


## Fractional Triangle-Free Polytope

The simplest relaxation of $P_{3}(G)$ is the fractional triangle free polytope of $G$, FRAC $_{\Delta}(G)$, the set defined by the following inequalities.

- $1 \geq x_{i} \geq 0$ for $i \in E(0-1$ constrains $)$;
- $x_{i}+x_{j}+x_{k} \leq 2$ for all $\{i, j, k\} \in \mathcal{K}_{3}$ (triangle constrains).


## Fractional Triangle-Free Polytope

The simplest relaxation of $P_{3}(G)$ is the fractional triangle free polytope of $G$, $\operatorname{FRAC}_{\Delta}(G)$, the set defined by the following inequalities.

- $1 \geq x_{i} \geq 0$ for $i \in E(0-1$ constrains $)$;
- $x_{i}+x_{j}+x_{k} \leq 2$ for all $\{i, j, k\} \in \mathcal{K}_{3}$ (triangle constrains).

It is possible to optimize over this polytope in polynomial time.

## Fractional Triangle-Free Polytope

The simplest relaxation of $P_{3}(G)$ is the fractional triangle free polytope of $G, \operatorname{FRAC}_{\Delta}(G)$, the set defined by the following inequalities.

- $1 \geq x_{i} \geq 0$ for $i \in E(0-1$ constrains $)$;
- $x_{i}+x_{j}+x_{k} \leq 2$ for all $\{i, j, k\} \in \mathcal{K}_{3}$ (triangle constrains).

It is possible to optimize over this polytope in polynomial time.
Krivelevich [1995] proved for the unweighted triangle cover version an approximation factor of 2.

## Fractional Triangle-Free Polytope

The simplest relaxation of $P_{3}(G)$ is the fractional triangle free polytope of $G, \operatorname{FRAC}_{\Delta}(G)$, the set defined by the following inequalities.

- $1 \geq x_{i} \geq 0$ for $i \in E(0-1$ constrains $)$;
- $x_{i}+x_{j}+x_{k} \leq 2$ for all $\{i, j, k\} \in \mathcal{K}_{3}$ (triangle constrains).

It is possible to optimize over this polytope in polynomial time.
Krivelevich [1995] proved for the unweighted triangle cover version an approximation factor of 2.

We want to use moment matrices to approximate this problem.

## Triangle Ideal and sums of squares approximations

 The polynomials vanishing on $S_{3}$ are those in the ideal$$
I_{3}=\left\langle x_{e} x_{f} x_{g}, x_{i}^{2}-x_{i}: \forall \text { triangles }\{e, f, g\}, \forall i \in E\right\rangle
$$

## Triangle Ideal and sums of squares approximations

 The polynomials vanishing on $S_{3}$ are those in the ideal$$
I_{3}=\left\langle x_{e} x_{f} x_{g}, x_{i}^{2}-x_{i}: \forall \text { triangles }\{e, f, g\}, \forall i \in E\right\rangle .
$$

$f \in \mathbb{R}[x]$ is $k$-sos modulo $I_{3}$ if and only if

$$
f \equiv\left(h_{1}^{2}+h_{2}^{2}+\ldots+h_{m}^{2}\right) \quad \bmod I_{3},
$$

for some polynomials $h_{1}, \ldots, h_{m}$ with degree less or equal $k$.

## Triangle Ideal and sums of squares approximations

 The polynomials vanishing on $S_{3}$ are those in the ideal$$
I_{3}=\left\langle x_{e} x_{f} x_{g}, x_{i}^{2}-x_{i}: \forall \text { triangles }\{e, f, g\}, \forall i \in E\right\rangle
$$

$f \in \mathbb{R}[x]$ is $k$-sos modulo $I_{3}$ if and only if

$$
f \equiv\left(h_{1}^{2}+h_{2}^{2}+\ldots+h_{m}^{2}\right) \quad \bmod I_{3},
$$

for some polynomials $h_{1}, \ldots, h_{m}$ with degree less or equal $k$.
Theta Bodies of an ideal

$$
\mathrm{TH}_{d}(/ 3)=\bigcap_{\ell \text { linear }, \ell \text {-sos modulo /3 }}\left\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{E}: \ell(\mathbf{x}) \geq 0\right\}
$$

## Triangle Ideal and sums of squares approximations

 The polynomials vanishing on $S_{3}$ are those in the ideal$$
I_{3}=\left\langle x_{e} x_{f} x_{g}, x_{i}^{2}-x_{i}: \forall \text { triangles }\{e, f, g\}, \forall i \in E\right\rangle
$$

$f \in \mathbb{R}[x]$ is $k$-sos modulo $I_{3}$ if and only if

$$
f \equiv\left(h_{1}^{2}+h_{2}^{2}+\ldots+h_{m}^{2}\right) \quad \bmod I_{3},
$$

for some polynomials $h_{1}, \ldots, h_{m}$ with degree less or equal $k$.
Theta Bodies of an ideal

$$
\mathrm{TH}_{d}(/ 3)=\bigcap_{\ell \text { linear }, \ell \text { k-sos modulo /3 }}\left\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{E}: \ell(\mathbf{x}) \geq 0\right\}
$$

We have $P_{3}(G) \subseteq \cdots \subseteq \mathrm{TH}_{3}\left(/_{3}\right) \subseteq \mathrm{TH}_{2}\left(/_{3}\right) \subseteq \operatorname{FRAC}_{\Delta}(G)$.

## Facets of $P_{3}(G)$

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub catalogued some families of facets for the polytope of the $K_{3}$-free problem. Among them:

1. Binary inequalities: $0 \leq x_{k} \leq 1$, for all $k \in E$,

## Facets of $P_{3}(G)$

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub catalogued some families of facets for the polytope of the $K_{3}$-free problem. Among them:

1. Binary inequalities: $0 \leq x_{k} \leq 1$, for all $k \in E$,
2. Triangle inequalities: $x_{i}+x_{j}+x_{k} \leq 2$ for all $\{i, j, k\} \in \mathcal{K}_{3}$

## Facets of $P_{3}(G)$

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub catalogued some families of facets for the polytope of the $K_{3}$-free problem. Among them:

1. Binary inequalities: $0 \leq x_{k} \leq 1$, for all $k \in E$,
2. Triangle inequalities: $x_{i}+x_{j}+x_{k} \leq 2$ for all $\{i, j, k\} \in \mathcal{K}_{3}$
3. $\Delta$-p-hole inequalities:

## Facets of $P_{3}(G)$

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub catalogued some families of facets for the polytope of the $K_{3}$-free problem. Among them:

1. Binary inequalities: $0 \leq x_{k} \leq 1$, for all $k \in E$,
2. Triangle inequalities: $x_{i}+x_{j}+x_{k} \leq 2$ for all $\{i, j, k\} \in \mathcal{K}_{3}$
3. $\Delta$-p-hole inequalities: ????

## $\Delta$-p holes

A $\Delta$ - $p$-hole is a graph made up of $p$ copies of $K_{3}, C_{1}, C_{2}, \cdots, C_{p}$ such that $C_{k}$ and $C_{j}$ share an edge if and only if $|k-j| \equiv 1$.

## $\Delta$-p holes

A $\Delta$-p-hole is a graph made up of $p$ copies of $K_{3}, C_{1}, C_{2}, \cdots, C_{p}$ such that $C_{k}$ and $C_{j}$ share an edge if and only if $|k-j| \equiv 1$.


## $\Delta$-p holes

A $\Delta$ - $p$-hole is a graph made up of $p$ copies of $K_{3}, C_{1}, C_{2}, \cdots, C_{p}$ such that $C_{k}$ and $C_{j}$ share an edge if and only if $|k-j| \equiv 1$.


In particular wheels of order $\Delta$-p-holes.

## $\Delta$-p holes

A $\Delta$-p-hole is a graph made up of $p$ copies of $K_{3}, C_{1}, C_{2}, \cdots, C_{p}$ such that $C_{k}$ and $C_{j}$ share an edge if and only if $|k-j| \equiv 1$.


In particular wheels of order $\Delta-p$-holes.
If $p$ odd, and $H \subseteq G$ a $\Delta-p$-hole, $P_{3}(G)$ has a facet:

$$
\sum_{H} x_{j} \leq 3\left(\frac{p-1}{2}\right)+1
$$

## Separation

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub give polytime separation algorithm for several families of facets, including binary, clique and wheel inequalities, thus providing a polytime algorithm to optimize over them.

They couldn't give a separation algorithm for the more general $\Delta$ - $p$-hole inequalities.

## Separation

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub give polytime separation algorithm for several families of facets, including binary, clique and wheel inequalities, thus providing a polytime algorithm to optimize over them.

They couldn't give a separation algorithm for the more general $\Delta$ - $p$-hole inequalities.
Let $Q(G)$ be the polytope cut out by binary, clique and $\Delta$ - $p$-hole inequalities.

## Separation

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub give polytime separation algorithm for several families of facets, including binary, clique and wheel inequalities, thus providing a polytime algorithm to optimize over them.
They couldn't give a separation algorithm for the more general $\Delta-p$-hole inequalities.
Let $Q(G)$ be the polytope cut out by binary, clique and $\Delta-p$-hole inequalities.

## Containment

$$
P_{3}(G) \subseteq \mathrm{TH}_{2}\left(I_{3}\right) \subseteq Q(G) .
$$

## Separation

Comforti-Corneil-Mahjoub give polytime separation algorithm for several families of facets, including binary, clique and wheel inequalities, thus providing a polytime algorithm to optimize over them.
They couldn't give a separation algorithm for the more general $\Delta-p$-hole inequalities.
Let $Q(G)$ be the polytope cut out by binary, clique and $\Delta-p$-hole inequalities.

## Containment

$$
P_{3}(G) \subseteq \mathrm{TH}_{2}\left(I_{3}\right) \subseteq Q(G) .
$$

## General Containment

$$
P_{i}(G) \subseteq \mathrm{TH}_{[i / 2]}\left(I_{i}\right) \subseteq Q(G) .
$$

## Proof by example

Enough to give an sos certificate.

## Proof by example

Enough to give an sos certificate.


## Proof by example

Enough to give an sos certificate.


$$
7-\sum x_{i}-\sum y_{i}=
$$

## Proof by example

Enough to give an sos certificate.


$$
\begin{aligned}
7-\sum x_{i}-\sum y_{i}= & \left(1-y_{1}-x_{1} x_{2}\right)^{2}+\left(1-y_{2}-x_{2} x_{3}\right)^{2} \\
& +\left(1-y_{3}-x_{3} x_{4}\right)^{2}+\left(1-y_{4}-x_{5} x_{5}\right)^{2} \\
& +\left(1-y_{5}-x_{5} x_{1}\right)^{2} \\
& +\left(1-x_{1}-x_{2}-x_{3}+x_{1} x_{2}+x_{2} x_{3}+x_{1} x_{3}\right)^{2}{ }^{2} \\
& +\left(1-x_{3}-x_{4}-x_{5}+x_{3} x_{4}+x_{3} x_{5}+x_{4} x_{5}\right)^{2} \\
& +\left(x_{3}-x_{3} x_{1}-x_{3} x_{5}+x_{1} x_{5}\right)^{2}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Properties of the relaxation (triangle-case)

Using the relation between triangle free graphs and cuts, and a result by Laurent we get

Convergence limitations
$P_{3}\left(K_{n}\right) \subsetneq \mathrm{TH}_{i}\left(l_{3}\right)$ for all $i<(n-2) / 4$.

## Properties of the relaxation (triangle-case)

Using the relation between triangle free graphs and cuts, and a result by Laurent we get

Convergence limitations
$P_{3}\left(K_{n}\right) \subsetneq \mathrm{TH}_{i}\left(I_{3}\right)$ for all $i<(n-2) / 4$.

Let $\tau$ be the triangle cover number of $G$. We can approximate it by

$$
\tau^{\dagger}=|E|-\max _{x \in \operatorname{TH}_{2}\left(I_{3}\right)}\langle x, \mathbb{1}\rangle .
$$

Approximation ratio
For all $G$ we have $2 \tau^{\dagger}(G) \geq \tau(G) \geq \tau^{\dagger}(G)$.

## Tuza's Conjecture

Let $G=(V, E)$ be a graph and $\nu(G)$ be its triangle packing number.


## Tuza's Conjecture

Let $G=(V, E)$ be a graph and $\nu(G)$ be its triangle packing number.


$$
\nu(G)=2
$$

## Tuza's Conjecture

Let $G=(V, E)$ be a graph and $\nu(G)$ be its triangle packing number.

$\nu(G)=2$


$$
\tau(G)=3
$$

## Tuza's Conjecture

Let $G=(V, E)$ be a graph and $\nu(G)$ be its triangle packing number.


$$
\nu(G)=2
$$



$$
\tau(G)=3
$$

Tuza's Conjecture
$\tau(G) \leq 2 \nu(G)$

Note that $\tau(G) \leq 3 \nu(G)$ is trivial.

## Tuza's Conjecture

Let $G=(V, E)$ be a graph and $\nu(G)$ be its triangle packing number.


$$
\nu(G)=2
$$



$$
\tau(G)=3
$$

## Tuza's Conjecture

$\tau(G) \leq 2 \nu(G)$

Note that $\tau(G) \leq 3 \nu(G)$ is trivial.
$\tau^{\text {frac }}(G) \leq 2 \nu(G)$ [Krivelevich], is it true that $\tau^{\dagger}(G) \leq 2 \nu(G)$ ?

## The end

## Thank You

