# (Minimal)SDP-lifts of Polytopes 

João Gouveia

University of Coimbra

21st March 2013-4th SDP days - CWI

1. Linear Representations and Yannakakis Theorem

## Polytopes

The usual way to describe a polytope $P$ is by listing the vertices or giving an inequality description

$$
P=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{n}: a_{1} x_{1}+a_{2} x_{2}+\cdots+a_{n} x_{n} \geq b\right\}
$$

where $b$ and $a_{i}$ are real vectors and the inequalities are taken entry-wise.

## Polytopes

The usual way to describe a polytope $P$ is by listing the vertices or giving an inequality description

$$
P=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{n}: a_{1} x_{1}+a_{2} x_{2}+\cdots+a_{n} x_{n} \geq b\right\}
$$

where $b$ and $a_{i}$ are real vectors and the inequalities are taken entry-wise.

## Example:



## Polytopes

The usual way to describe a polytope $P$ is by listing the vertices or giving an inequality description

$$
P=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{n}: a_{1} x_{1}+a_{2} x_{2}+\cdots+a_{n} x_{n} \geq b\right\}
$$

where $b$ and $a_{i}$ are real vectors and the inequalities are taken entry-wise.

Example:


## Linear Representations of Polytopes

If a polytope has many facets and vertices we would like a better description.

## Linear Representations of Polytopes

If a polytope has many facets and vertices we would like a better description.

A linear representation of a polytope $P$ is a description

$$
P=\left\{x: \exists y, a_{1} x_{1}+\cdots+a_{n} x_{n}+a_{n+1} y_{1}+\cdots a_{n+m} y_{m} \geq b\right\}
$$

i.e., a description of $P$ as a projection of a higher dimensional polytope.

## Linear Representations of Polytopes

If a polytope has many facets and vertices we would like a better description.

A linear representation of a polytope $P$ is a description

$$
P=\left\{x: \exists y, a_{1} x_{1}+\cdots+a_{n} x_{n}+a_{n+1} y_{1}+\cdots a_{n+m} y_{m} \geq b\right\}
$$

i.e., a description of $P$ as a projection of a higher dimensional polytope.


Linear representation of a square.

## Linear Representations of Polytopes

If a polytope has many facets and vertices we would like a better description.

A linear representation of a polytope $P$ is a description

$$
P=\left\{x: \exists y, a_{1} x_{1}+\cdots+a_{n} x_{n}+a_{n+1} y_{1}+\cdots a_{n+m} y_{m} \geq b\right\}
$$

i.e., a description of $P$ as a projection of a higher dimensional polytope.


Linear representation of a square.

Linear representation of an hexagon.

## Why?

The projection of a polytope can have many more facets than the original:

## Why?

The projection of a polytope can have many more facets than the original:
(Ben-Tal + Nemirovski, 2001): A regular n-gon can be written as the projection of a polytope with $2\left\lceil\log _{2}(n)\right\rceil$ sides.


## Why?

The projection of a polytope can have many more facets than the original:
(Ben-Tal + Nemirovski, 2001): A regular $n$-gon can be written as the projection of a polytope with $2\left\lceil\log _{2}(n)\right\rceil$ sides.


To do linear optimization on the projection we can optimize on the "upper" polytope.

## Why?

The projection of a polytope can have many more facets than the original:
(Ben-Tal + Nemirovski, 2001): A regular $n$-gon can be written as the projection of a polytope with $2\left\lceil\log _{2}(n)\right\rceil$ sides.


To do linear optimization on the projection we can optimize on the "upper" polytope.
Given a polytope $P$ we are interested in finding how small can its linear representation be. This tells us how hard it is to optimize over $P$ using LP.

## Slack Matrix

Let $P$ be a polytope with facets given by $h_{1}(x) \geq 0, \ldots, h_{f}(x) \geq 0$, and vertices $p_{1}, \ldots, p_{v}$.

## Slack Matrix

Let $P$ be a polytope with facets given by $h_{1}(x) \geq 0, \ldots, h_{f}(x) \geq 0$, and vertices $p_{1}, \ldots, p_{v}$.

The slack matrix of $P$ is the matrix $S_{P} \in \mathbb{R}^{f \times v}$ given by

$$
S_{P}(i, j)=h_{i}\left(p_{j}\right)
$$

## Slack Matrix

Let $P$ be a polytope with facets given by $h_{1}(x) \geq 0, \ldots, h_{f}(x) \geq 0$, and vertices $p_{1}, \ldots, p_{v}$.

The slack matrix of $P$ is the matrix $S_{P} \in \mathbb{R}^{f \times v}$ given by

$$
S_{P}(i, j)=h_{i}\left(p_{j}\right)
$$

Example: For the unit cube.

## Slack Matrix

Let $P$ be a polytope with facets given by $h_{1}(x) \geq 0, \ldots, h_{f}(x) \geq 0$, and vertices $p_{1}, \ldots, p_{v}$.

The slack matrix of $P$ is the matrix $S_{P} \in \mathbb{R}^{f \times v}$ given by

$$
S_{P}(i, j)=h_{i}\left(p_{j}\right)
$$

Example: For the unit cube.

| 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 |

$$
\begin{gathered}
x \geq 0 \\
y \geq 0 \\
z \geq 0 \\
1-x \geq 0 \\
1-y \geq 0 \\
1-z \geq 0
\end{gathered}
$$

## Slack Matrix

Let $P$ be a polytope with facets given by $h_{1}(x) \geq 0, \ldots, h_{f}(x) \geq 0$, and vertices $p_{1}, \ldots, p_{v}$.

The slack matrix of $P$ is the matrix $S_{P} \in \mathbb{R}^{f \times v}$ given by

$$
S_{P}(i, j)=h_{i}\left(p_{j}\right)
$$

Example: For the unit cube.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \begin{array}{l|l|l|l|l|l|l|l}
0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1
\end{array} \\
& \begin{aligned}
x & \geq 0 \\
y & \geq 0 \\
z & \geq 0 \\
1-x & \geq 0 \\
1-y & \geq 0 \\
1-z & \geq 0
\end{aligned}\left[\begin{array}{llllllll}
0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\
& & & & & & & \\
& & & & & & & \\
& & & & & & & \\
& & & & & & & \\
\end{array}\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

## Slack Matrix

Let $P$ be a polytope with facets given by
$h_{1}(x) \geq 0, \ldots, h_{f}(x) \geq 0$, and vertices $p_{1}, \ldots, p_{v}$.
The slack matrix of $P$ is the matrix $S_{P} \in \mathbb{R}^{f \times v}$ given by

$$
S_{P}(i, j)=h_{i}\left(p_{j}\right)
$$

Example: For the unit cube.

|  | 0 | 1 0 0 | 0 1 0 | 0 0 1 | 1 1 0 | 0 1 1 | 1 0 1 | 1 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $x \geq 0$ | [ 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| $y \geq 0$ | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 |  |  |  | 1 |
| $z \geq 0$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $1-x \geq 0$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $1-y \geq 0$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $1-z \geq 0$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

## Slack Matrix

Let $P$ be a polytope with facets given by $h_{1}(x) \geq 0, \ldots, h_{f}(x) \geq 0$, and vertices $p_{1}, \ldots, p_{v}$.

The slack matrix of $P$ is the matrix $S_{P} \in \mathbb{R}^{f \times v}$ given by

$$
S_{P}(i, j)=h_{i}\left(p_{j}\right)
$$

Example: For the unit cube.
$x \geq 0$
$y \geq 0$
$z \geq 0$
$1-x \geq 0$
$1-y \geq 0$
$1-z \geq 0$$\quad\left[\begin{array}{lll|l|l|l|l|l|l}0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0\end{array}\right]$

## Nonnegative Factorizations

Let $M$ be an $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix.

## Nonnegative Factorizations

Let $M$ be an $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix.

A nonnegative factorization of $M$ of size $k$ is a pair of nonnegative matrices $A, m$ by $k$, and $B, k$ by $n$, such that

$$
M=A \times B
$$

## Nonnegative Factorizations

Let $M$ be an $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix.

A nonnegative factorization of $M$ of size $k$ is a pair of nonnegative matrices $A, m$ by $k$, and $B, k$ by $n$, such that

$$
M=A \times B
$$

Equivalently, it is a collection of nonnegative vectors $a_{1}, \cdots, a_{m}$ and $b_{1}, \cdots b_{n}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{k}$ such that $M_{i, j}=\left\langle a_{i}, b_{j}\right\rangle$.

## Nonnegative Factorizations

Let $M$ be an $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix.

A nonnegative factorization of $M$ of size $k$ is a pair of nonnegative matrices $A, m$ by $k$, and $B, k$ by $n$, such that

$$
M=A \times B
$$

Equivalently, it is a collection of nonnegative vectors $a_{1}, \cdots, a_{m}$ and $b_{1}, \cdots b_{n}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{k}$ such that $M_{i, j}=\left\langle a_{i}, b_{j}\right\rangle$.

Example:

$$
M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}
1 & 1 & 2 \\
1 & 3 & 3 \\
0 & 2 & 1
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Nonnegative Factorizations

Let $M$ be an $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix.
A nonnegative factorization of $M$ of size $k$ is a pair of nonnegative matrices $A, m$ by $k$, and $B, k$ by $n$, such that

$$
M=A \times B
$$

Equivalently, it is a collection of nonnegative vectors $a_{1}, \cdots, a_{m}$ and $b_{1}, \cdots b_{n}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{k}$ such that $M_{i, j}=\left\langle a_{i}, b_{j}\right\rangle$.

Example:

$$
M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}
1 & 1 & 2 \\
1 & 3 & 3 \\
0 & 2 & 1
\end{array}\right]=\left[\begin{array}{ll}
1 & 0 \\
1 & 1 \\
0 & 1
\end{array}\right]\left[\begin{array}{lll}
1 & 1 & 2 \\
0 & 2 & 1
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Yannakakis Theorem

Theorem (Yannakakis 1991)
Let $P$ be any polytope and $S$ its slack matrix. Then the following are equal.

## Yannakakis Theorem

Theorem (Yannakakis 1991)
Let $P$ be any polytope and $S$ its slack matrix. Then the following are equal.

- The least number of facets of a polytope $Q$ whose projection is $P$.


## Yannakakis Theorem

Theorem (Yannakakis 1991)
Let $P$ be any polytope and $S$ its slack matrix. Then the following are equal.

- The least number of facets of a polytope $Q$ whose projection is $P$.
- The least $k$ such that $S$ has a nonnegative factorization of size $k$. $\left[\mathrm{rank}_{+}(S)\right]$


## Hexagon

Consider the regular hexagon.

## Hexagon

Consider the regular hexagon.


## Hexagon

Consider the regular hexagon.

It has a $6 \times 6$ slack matrix.


## Hexagon

Consider the regular hexagon.

It has a $6 \times 6$ slack matrix.


$$
\left[\begin{array}{llllll}
0 & 0 & 1 & 2 & 2 & 1 \\
1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 & 2 \\
2 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \\
2 & 2 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 2 & 2 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 2 & 2 & 1 & 0
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Hexagon

Consider the regular hexagon.

It has a $6 \times 6$ slack matrix.


$$
\left[\begin{array}{llllll}
0 & 0 & 1 & 2 & 2 & 1 \\
1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 & 2 \\
2 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \\
2 & 2 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 2 & 2 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 2 & 2 & 1 & 0
\end{array}\right]=\left[\begin{array}{lllll}
1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \\
0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\
0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 2 & 1 & 0
\end{array}\right]\left[\begin{array}{llllll}
0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 & 1 \\
1 & 2 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Hexagon

Consider the regular hexagon.

It has a $6 \times 6$ slack matrix.

2. Semidefinite Representations: General Yannakakis Theorem

## Semidefinite Representations

A semidefinite representation of size $k$ of a polytope $P$ is a description

$$
P=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{n} \mid \exists y \text { s.t. } A_{0}+\sum A_{i} x_{i}+\sum B_{i} y_{i} \succeq 0\right\}
$$

where $A_{j}$ and $B_{i}$ are $k \times k$ real symmetric matrices.

## Semidefinite Representations

A semidefinite representation of size $k$ of a polytope $P$ is a description

$$
P=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{n} \mid \exists y \text { s.t. } A_{0}+\sum A_{i} x_{i}+\sum B_{i} y_{i} \succeq 0\right\}
$$

where $A_{j}$ and $B_{i}$ are $k \times k$ real symmetric matrices.
Given a polytope $P$ we are interested in finding how small can such a description be.

## Semidefinite Representations

A semidefinite representation of size $k$ of a polytope $P$ is a description

$$
P=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{n} \mid \exists y \text { s.t. } A_{0}+\sum A_{i} x_{i}+\sum B_{i} y_{i} \succeq 0\right\}
$$

where $A_{j}$ and $B_{i}$ are $k \times k$ real symmetric matrices.
Given a polytope $P$ we are interested in finding how small can such a description be.

This tells us how hard it is to optimize over $P$ using semidefinite programming.

## The Square

The $0 / 1$ square is the projection onto $x_{1}$ and $x_{2}$ of
$\left[\begin{array}{ccc}1 & x_{1} & x_{2} \\ x_{1} & x_{1} & y \\ x_{2} & y & x_{2}\end{array}\right] \succeq 0$.

## The Square

The $0 / 1$ square is the projection onto $x_{1}$ and $x_{2}$ of

$$
\left[\begin{array}{ccc}
1 & x_{1} & x_{2} \\
x_{1} & x_{1} & y \\
x_{2} & y & x_{2}
\end{array}\right] \succeq 0 .
$$



## Semidefinite Factorizations

Let $M$ be a $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix.

## Semidefinite Factorizations

 $M$ is a set of $k \times k$ positive semidefinite matrices $A_{1}, \cdots, A_{m}$ and $B_{1}, \cdots B_{n}$ such that $M_{i, j}=\left\langle A_{i}, B_{j}\right\rangle$.

## Semidefinite Factorizations

Let $M$ be a $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix. $\mathrm{APSD}_{k}$-factorization of $M$ is a set of $k \times k$ positive semidefinite matrices $A_{1}, \cdots, A_{m}$ and $B_{1}, \cdots B_{n}$ such that $M_{i, j}=\left\langle A_{i}, B_{j}\right\rangle$.
$\left[\begin{array}{lll}1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1\end{array}\right]$

## Semidefinite Factorizations

Let $M$ be a $m$ by $n$ nonnegative matrix. $\mathrm{APSD}_{k}$-factorization of $M$ is a set of $k \times k$ positive semidefinite matrices $A_{1}, \cdots, A_{m}$ and $B_{1}, \cdots B_{n}$ such that $M_{i, j}=\left\langle A_{i}, B_{j}\right\rangle$.

$$
\left[\begin{array}{cc}
1 / 2 & -1 / 2 \\
-1 / 2 & 1
\end{array}\right] \quad\left[\begin{array}{cc}
1 / 2 & 0 \\
0 & 0
\end{array}\right] \quad\left[\begin{array}{ll}
0 & 0 \\
0 & 1
\end{array}\right]
$$

$\left[\begin{array}{lll}2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0\end{array}\right]\left[\begin{array}{ll}1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1\end{array}\right]\left[\begin{array}{ll}2 & 1 \\ 1 & 1\end{array}\right]\left[\begin{array}{lll}1 & 0 & 1\end{array}\right]$

## Semidefinite Yannakakis Theorem

Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2011)
A polytope $P$ has a semidefinite representation of size $k$ if and only if its slack matrix has a $\mathrm{PSD}_{k}$-factorization.

## Semidefinite Yannakakis Theorem

Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2011)
A polytope $P$ has a semidefinite representation of size $k$ if and only if its slack matrix has a $\mathrm{PSD}_{k}$-factorization.

The psd rank of $M$, $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M)$ is the smallest $k$ for which $M$ has a $\mathrm{PSD}_{k}$-factorization.

## Semidefinite Yannakakis Theorem

Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2011)
A polytope $P$ has a semidefinite representation of size $k$ if and only if its slack matrix has a $\mathrm{PSD}_{k}$-factorization.

The psd rank of $M$, $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M)$ is the smallest $k$ for which $M$ has a $\mathrm{PSD}_{k}$-factorization.

The psd rank of a polytope $P$ is defined as

$$
\operatorname{rank}_{p s d}(P):=\operatorname{rank}_{p s d}\left(S_{P}\right)
$$

## The Hexagon

Consider again the regular hexagon.


## The Hexagon

Consider again the regular hexagon.


Its $6 \times 6$ slack matrix.

$$
\left[\begin{array}{llllll}
0 & 0 & 2 & 4 & 4 & 2 \\
2 & 0 & 0 & 2 & 4 & 4 \\
4 & 2 & 0 & 0 & 2 & 4 \\
4 & 4 & 2 & 0 & 0 & 2 \\
2 & 4 & 4 & 2 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 2 & 4 & 4 & 2 & 0
\end{array}\right]
$$

## The Hexagon

Consider again the regular hexagon.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& {\left[\begin{array}{llllll}
0 & 0 & 2 & 4 & 4 & 2 \\
2 & 0 & 0 & 2 & 4 & 4 \\
4 & 2 & 0 & 0 & 2 & 4 \\
4 & 4 & 2 & 0 & 0 & 2 \\
2 & 4 & 4 & 2 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 2 & 4 & 4 & 2 & 0
\end{array}\right]} \\
& {\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & -1 & 0 & 1 \\
-1 & 1 & 0 & -1 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & -1 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 1 & -1 \\
0 & 1 & 1 & -1 \\
0 & -1 & -1 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{llll}
1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{llll}
1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & 1 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],} \\
& {\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & -1 & 1 \\
0 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\
0 & 1 & -1 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & -1 & 1 & 0 \\
-1 & 1 & -1 & 0 \\
1 & -1 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],} \\
& \rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

## The Hexagon

Consider again the regular hexagon.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \rangle \\
& {\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & -1 & 0 & 1 \\
-1 & 1 & 0 & -1 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & -1 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 1 & -1 \\
0 & 1 & 1 & -1 \\
0 & -1 & -1 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{llll}
1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{llll}
1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
1 & 1 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],} \\
& {\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & -1 & 1 \\
0 & -1 & 1 & -1 \\
0 & 1 & -1 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & -1 & 1 & 0 \\
-1 & 1 & -1 & 0 \\
1 & -1 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{llll}
1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{llll}
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],} \\
& {\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & -1 & 0 \\
0 & -1 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & -1 & 0 & 0 \\
-1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 0 & -1 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & -1 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right],\left[\begin{array}{llll}
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right]} \\
& {\left[\begin{array}{llllll}
0 & 0 & 2 & 4 & 4 & 2 \\
2 & 0 & 0 & 2 & 4 & 4 \\
4 & 2 & 0 & 0 & 2 & 4 \\
4 & 4 & 2 & 0 & 0 & 2 \\
2 & 4 & 4 & 2 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 2 & 4 & 4 & 2 & 0
\end{array}\right]}
\end{aligned}
$$

## The Hexagon - continued

The regular hexagon must have a size 4 representation.

## The Hexagon - continued

The regular hexagon must have a size 4 representation.

Consider the affinely equivalent hexagon $H$ with vertices
$( \pm 1,0),(0, \pm 1),(1,-1)$ and $(-1,1)$.


## The Hexagon - continued

The regular hexagon must have a size 4 representation.

Consider the affinely equivalent hexagon $H$ with vertices $( \pm 1,0),(0, \pm 1),(1,-1)$ and $(-1,1)$.


$$
H=\left\{\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right):\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
1 & x_{1} & x_{2} & x_{1}+x_{2} \\
x_{1} & 1 & y_{1} & y_{2} \\
x_{2} & y_{1} & 1 & y_{3} \\
x_{1}+x_{2} & y_{2} & y_{3} & 1
\end{array}\right] \succeq 0\right\}
$$

3. Nonnegative and Semidefinite ranks

## Basic Facts

Let $M$ be a $p$ by $q$ nonnegative matrix. Then:

## Basic Facts

Let $M$ be a $p$ by $q$ nonnegative matrix. Then:

- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M) \leq \min \{p, q\}$.


## Basic Facts

Let $M$ be a $p$ by $q$ nonnegative matrix. Then:

- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M) \leq \min \{p, q\}$.
- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq\binom{\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M)+1}{2}$.


## Basic Facts

Let $M$ be a $p$ by $q$ nonnegative matrix. Then:

- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M) \leq \min \{p, q\}$.
- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq\left(\begin{array}{c}\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M)+1\end{array}\right)$.
- $\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M)$.


## Basic Facts

Let $M$ be a $p$ by $q$ nonnegative matrix. Then:

- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M) \leq \min \{p, q\}$.
- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq\binom{\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M)+1}{2}$.
- $\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M)$.

Computing these ranks is hard. In fact checking if $\operatorname{rank}(M)=\operatorname{rank}_{+}(M)$ is NP-Hard (Vavasis '07).

## Basic Facts

Let $M$ be a $p$ by $q$ nonnegative matrix. Then:

- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M) \leq \min \{p, q\}$.
- $\operatorname{rank}(M) \leq\left(\underset{2}{\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M)+1}\right)$.
- $\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{+}(M)$.

Computing these ranks is hard. In fact checking if $\operatorname{rank}(M)=\operatorname{rank}_{+}(M)$ is NP-Hard (Vavasis '07).

Many other complexity questions are open.

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

Example:

$$
M=\left[\begin{array}{llll}
0 & 3 & 1 & 4 \\
7 & 0 & 2 & 1 \\
3 & 2 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 1 & 3 & 0
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

Example:

$$
M=\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
0 & 3 & 1 / 4 & 4 \\
7 & 0 & 2 / 1 \\
3 & 2 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 1 & 3 & 0
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

Example:

$$
M=\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
0 & 3 & 1 / 4 & 4 \\
7 & 0 & 2 / & 1 \\
3 / 2 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 1 & 3 & 0
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

Example:

$$
M=\left[\begin{array}{cccc}
0 & \boxed{3} & 1 & 4 \\
7 & 0 & 2 & 1 \\
3 / 2 & 0 & 1 \\
1 & 2 & 3 & 0
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

Example:

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

Example:

$$
M=\left[\right]
$$

In this case rank ${ }_{+}(M) \geq 4$.

## Rectangle covering bound

The nonnegative rank of a matrix $M$ is larger than the size of its smallest rectangle cover.

Example:

In this case rank $_{+}(M) \geq 4$.

The rectangle bound corresponds to the boolean rank and also relates to the minimum communication complexity of a 2-party protocol to compute the support of $M$.

## Hadamard Square Roots

A Hadamard Square Root of a nonnegative matrix $M$, denoted $\sqrt[H]{M}$, is a matrix whose entries are square roots (positive or negative) of the corresponding entries of $M$.

## Hadamard Square Roots

A Hadamard Square Root of a nonnegative matrix $M$, denoted $\sqrt[H]{M}$, is a matrix whose entries are square roots (positive or negative) of the corresponding entries of $M$.

Example:
$M=\left[\begin{array}{ll}1 & 0 \\ 2 & 1\end{array}\right]$;

## Hadamard Square Roots

A Hadamard Square Root of a nonnegative matrix $M$, denoted $\sqrt[H]{M}$, is a matrix whose entries are square roots (positive or negative) of the corresponding entries of $M$.

Example:
$M=\left[\begin{array}{ll}1 & 0 \\ 2 & 1\end{array}\right]$;
$\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}1 & 0 \\ \sqrt{2} & 1\end{array}\right]$

## Hadamard Square Roots

A Hadamard Square Root of a nonnegative matrix $M$, denoted $\sqrt[H]{M}$, is a matrix whose entries are square roots (positive or negative) of the corresponding entries of $M$.

Example:
$M=\left[\begin{array}{ll}1 & 0 \\ 2 & 1\end{array}\right]$;

$$
\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
1 & 0 \\
\sqrt{2} & 1
\end{array}\right] \text { or } \sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
-1 & 0 \\
\sqrt{2} & 1
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Hadamard Square Roots

A Hadamard Square Root of a nonnegative matrix $M$, denoted $\sqrt[H]{M}$, is a matrix whose entries are square roots (positive or negative) of the corresponding entries of $M$.

Example:
$M=\left[\begin{array}{ll}1 & 0 \\ 2 & 1\end{array}\right]$;

$$
\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
1 & 0 \\
\sqrt{2} & 1
\end{array}\right] \text { or } \sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
-1 & 0 \\
\sqrt{2} & 1
\end{array}\right] \text { or } \sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
-1 & 0 \\
-\sqrt{2} & 1
\end{array}\right] \text { or } \cdots
$$

## Hadamard Square Roots

A Hadamard Square Root of a nonnegative matrix $M$, denoted $\sqrt[H]{M}$, is a matrix whose entries are square roots (positive or negative) of the corresponding entries of $M$.

Example:
$M=\left[\begin{array}{ll}1 & 0 \\ 2 & 1\end{array}\right]$;
$\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}1 & 0 \\ \sqrt{2} & 1\end{array}\right]$ or $\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}-1 & 0 \\ \sqrt{2} & 1\end{array}\right]$ or $\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}-1 & 0 \\ -\sqrt{2} & 1\end{array}\right]$ or $\cdots$

We define $\operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)=\min \{\operatorname{rank}(\sqrt[H]{M})\}$.

## Hadamard Square Roots

A Hadamard Square Root of a nonnegative matrix $M$, denoted $\sqrt[H]{M}$, is a matrix whose entries are square roots (positive or negative) of the corresponding entries of $M$.

Example:
$M=\left[\begin{array}{ll}1 & 0 \\ 2 & 1\end{array}\right]$;
$\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}1 & 0 \\ \sqrt{2} & 1\end{array}\right]$ or $\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}-1 & 0 \\ \sqrt{2} & 1\end{array}\right]$ or $\sqrt[H]{M}=\left[\begin{array}{cc}-1 & 0 \\ -\sqrt{2} & 1\end{array}\right]$ or $\cdots$

We define $\operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)=\min \{\operatorname{rank}(\sqrt[H]{M})\}$.

## Hadamard Rank and Semidefinite Rank

## Proposition (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012)

$\operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)$ is the smallest $k$ for which we have a semidefinite factorization of $M$ of size $k$ using only rank one matrices.

## Hadamard Rank and Semidefinite Rank

## Proposition (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012)

$\operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)$ is the smallest $k$ for which we have a semidefinite factorization of $M$ of size $k$ using only rank one matrices.
In particular $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)$.

## Hadamard Rank and Semidefinite Rank

## Proposition (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012)

$\operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)$ is the smallest $k$ for which we have a semidefinite factorization of $M$ of size $k$ using only rank one matrices.
In particular $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)$.

Corollary
For 0/1 matrices

$$
\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}_{H}(M) \leq \operatorname{rank}(M) .
$$

## Examples

For $M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1\end{array}\right]$ we have:

## Examples

For $M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1\end{array}\right]$ we have:
$\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M)=2, \operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)=3, \quad \operatorname{rank}(M)=3$.

## Examples

For $M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1\end{array}\right]$ we have:

$$
\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M)=2, \operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)=3, \quad \operatorname{rank}(M)=3
$$

For $M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}0 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0\end{array}\right]$ we have:

## Examples

For $M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1\end{array}\right]$ we have:
$\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M)=2, \operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)=3, \quad \operatorname{rank}(M)=3$.

For $M=\left[\begin{array}{lll}0 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0\end{array}\right]$ we have:
$\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(M)=2, \operatorname{rank}_{H}(M)=2, \quad \operatorname{rank}(M)=3$.

## Example

Consider the matrix $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ defined by $a_{i, j}=(i-j)^{2}$.

$$
A=\left[\begin{array}{cccccc}
0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & 16 & \cdots \\
1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & \cdots \\
4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & \cdots \\
9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & \cdots \\
16 & 9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & \cdots \\
\vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots
\end{array}\right]
$$

- $\operatorname{rank}(A)=3$;


## Example

Consider the matrix $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ defined by $a_{i, j}=(i-j)^{2}$.

$$
A=\left[\begin{array}{cccccc}
0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & 16 & \cdots \\
1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & \cdots \\
4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & \cdots \\
9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & \cdots \\
16 & 9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & \cdots \\
\vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots
\end{array}\right]
$$

- $\operatorname{rank}(A)=3$;
- $\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(A)=2$;


## Example

Consider the matrix $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ defined by $a_{i, j}=(i-j)^{2}$.

$$
A=\left[\begin{array}{cccccc}
0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & 16 & \cdots \\
1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & \cdots \\
4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & \cdots \\
9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & \cdots \\
16 & 9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & \cdots \\
\vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots
\end{array}\right]
$$

- $\operatorname{rank}(A)=3$;
- $\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(A)=2$;
- $\operatorname{rank}_{+}(A) \geq \log _{2}(n)$ grows with $n$.


## Example

Consider the matrix $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$ defined by $a_{i, j}=(i-j)^{2}$.

$$
A=\left[\begin{array}{cccccc}
0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & 16 & \cdots \\
1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & 9 & \cdots \\
4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 4 & \cdots \\
9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & 1 & \cdots \\
16 & 9 & 4 & 1 & 0 & \cdots \\
\vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots
\end{array}\right]
$$

- $\operatorname{rank}(A)=3$;
- $\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(A)=2$;
- $\operatorname{rank}_{+}(A) \geq \log _{2}(n)$ grows with $n$.
rank ${ }_{+}$can be arbitrarily larger than rank and rank ${ }_{p s d}$.


## Lower Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (Goemans)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has nonnegative rank at least $\log (m)$.

## Lower Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (Goemans)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has nonnegative rank at least $\log (m)$.

Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2011)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has psd rank at least $O\left(\sqrt{\frac{\log (m)}{n \log (\log (m))}}\right)$.

## Lower Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (Goemans)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has nonnegative rank at least $\log (m)$.

Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2011)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has psd rank at least $O\left(\sqrt{\frac{\log (m)}{n \log (\log (m))}}\right)$.

For $P_{n}=n$-gon, rank $_{+}\left(P_{n}\right)$ and rank ${ }_{\text {psd }}\left(P_{n}\right)$ grow to infinity as $n$ grows, despite $\operatorname{rank}\left(S_{P_{n}}\right)=3$.

## Lower Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (Goemans)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has nonnegative rank at least $\log (m)$.

Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2011)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has psd rank at least $O\left(\sqrt{\frac{\log (m)}{\log (\log (m))}}\right)$.

For $P_{n}=n$-gon, rank $\left(P_{n}\right)$ and rank psd $\left(P_{n}\right)$ grow to infinity as $n$ grows, despite $\operatorname{rank}\left(S_{P_{n}}\right)=3$.

## Open questions:

- Separation between rank psd and rank $_{+}$for polytopes?


## Lower Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (Goemans)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has nonnegative rank at least $\log (m)$.

Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2011)
If a polytope $P$ in $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ has $m$ vertices, then it has psd rank at least $O\left(\sqrt{\frac{\log (m)}{\log (\log (m))}}\right)$.

For $P_{n}=n$-gon, rank $\left(P_{n}\right)$ and rank psd $\left(P_{n}\right)$ grow to infinity as $n$ grows, despite $\operatorname{rank}\left(S_{P_{n}}\right)=3$.

## Open questions:

- Separation between rank psd and rank $_{+}$for polytopes?
- True PSD bound $\sqrt{\log (m)}$ ?


## Upper Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (Fiorini-Rothvoss-Tiwary 2011)
Let $P$ be a generic polytope with $m$ vertices, then rank $_{+}(P) \geq \sqrt{2 m}$

## Upper Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
Let $P$ be a generic polytope with $m$ vertices, then $\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(P) \geq \sqrt[4]{m}$

## Upper Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
Let $P$ be a generic polytope with $m$ vertices, then $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(P) \geq \sqrt[4]{m}$

But how bad does it really get? Not much is known.

## Upper Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
Let $P$ be a generic polytope with $m$ vertices, then $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(P) \geq \sqrt[4]{m}$

But how bad does it really get? Not much is known.

Proposition (Shitov 2013)
All heptagons have nonnegative rank at most 6 , hence any $m$-gon has rank at most $6\left\lceil\frac{m}{7}\right\rceil$.

## Upper Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
Let $P$ be a generic polytope with $m$ vertices, then $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(P) \geq \sqrt[4]{m}$

But how bad does it really get? Not much is known.

Proposition (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
All hexagons have psd rank 4, hence any $m$-gon has rank at most $4\left\lceil\frac{m}{6}\right\rceil$.

## Upper Bounds for polytopes

Theorem (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
Let $P$ be a generic polytope with $m$ vertices, then $\operatorname{rank}_{\text {psd }}(P) \geq \sqrt[4]{m}$

But how bad does it really get? Not much is known.

Proposition (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
All hexagons have psd rank 4 , hence any $m$-gon has rank at most $4\left\lceil\frac{m}{6}\right\rceil$.

However, not even the heptagons are totally understood.

## Polytopes with minimal representations

Lemma
A polytope of dimension $d$ does not have a semidefinite representation of size smaller than $d+1$.

## Polytopes with minimal representations

Lemma
A polytope of dimension $d$ does not have a semidefinite representation of size smaller than $d+1$.

Using the Hadamard rank we recover an older result.
Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2009)
Let $P$ be a polytope with dimension $d$ whose slack matrix $S_{P}$ is $0 / 1$. Then $P$ has a semidefinite representation of size $d+1$.

## Polytopes with minimal representations

Lemma
A polytope of dimension $d$ does not have a semidefinite representation of size smaller than $d+1$.

Using the Hadamard rank we recover an older result.

## Theorem (G.-Parrilo-Thomas 2009)

Let $P$ be a polytope with dimension $d$ whose slack matrix $S_{P}$ is $0 / 1$. Then $P$ has a semidefinite representation of size $d+1$.

But we can say much more.
Theorem (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012)
Let $P$ have dimension $d$. Then

$$
\operatorname{rank}_{\mathrm{psd}}(P)=d+1 \Leftrightarrow \operatorname{rank}_{H}\left(S_{P}\right)=d+1 .
$$

## SDP-minimal Polytopes

We will say a dimension $d$ polytope $P$ is SDP-minimal if it has a semidefinite representation of size $d+1$.

## SDP-minimal Polytopes

We will say a dimension $d$ polytope $P$ is SDP-minimal if it has a semidefinite representation of size $d+1$.

On the plane the characterization is easy.

## SDP-minimal Polytopes

We will say a dimension $d$ polytope $P$ is SDP-minimal if it has a semidefinite representation of size $d+1$.

On the plane the characterization is easy.

## Proposition

A convex polygon is SDP-minimal if and only if it is a triangle or a quadrilateral.


## Octahedra

Proposition
If $P$ is combinatorially equivalent to an octahedron then it is SDP-minimal if and only if there are two distinct sets of four coplanar vertices of $P$.

## Octahedra

## Proposition

If $P$ is combinatorially equivalent to an octahedron then it is SDP-minimal if and only if there are two distinct sets of four coplanar vertices of $P$.


## Octahedra

## Proposition

If $P$ is combinatorially equivalent to an octahedron then it is SDP-minimal if and only if there are two distinct sets of four coplanar vertices of $P$.


## Octahedra

## Proposition

If $P$ is combinatorially equivalent to an octahedron then it is SDP-minimal if and only if there are two distinct sets of four coplanar vertices of $P$.


This translates to a dual result on cuboids.

## SDP-minimal Polyhedra

Proposition (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)
A polyhedron is SDP-minimal if and only if it is one of the following:

- a simplex;
- a triangular bi-pyramid;
- a triangular prism;
- an octahedron or a cuboid as in the previous proposition.


## SDP-minimal Polyhedra

## Proposition (G.-Robinson-Thomas 2012*)

A polyhedron is SDP-minimal if and only if it is one of the following:

- a simplex;
- a triangular bi-pyramid;
- a triangular prism;
- an octahedron or a cuboid as in the previous proposition.

Higher dimensions are completely open.

## Conclusion

PSD Factorization/rank is an exciting area of research with many recent breakthroughs and many open questions.

## Conclusion

PSD Factorization/rank is an exciting area of research with many recent breakthroughs and many open questions.

To read more on this:

Polytopes of Minimum Positive Semidefinite Rank - Gouveia, Robinson and Thomas - arXiv:1205.5306

Lifts of convex sets and cone factorizations - Gouveia, Parrilo and Thomas - arXiv:1111.3164

## Thank you

